## MINUTES REGULAR MEETING OF THE BUTLER PLANNING BOARD OCTOBER 17, 2024

Chairman Nargiso brought the regular meeting of the Butler Planning Board to order for October 17, 2024. The Chairman stated this meeting is being held in conformance with the Sunshine Law Requirements having been duly advertised and posted at Borough Hall.

Attorney Richard Brigliador conducted the swearing in of the newly appointed 4th class member, Jason Hammaker.

## **ROLL CALL:**

Present: Hough, Veneziano, Finelli, Brown, Reger, Nargiso
Absent: Vath, Roche, Hammaker, Piccirillo, Martinez (all excused)
Also present: Richard Brigliadoro, Attorney; Tom Boorady, Engineer; Tom Behrens, Planner; Gary Anderson, Traffic Engineer

## CORRESPONDENCE: None

## CASES TO BE HEARD:

SP22-83	QQR, LLC	Site Plan
B.O.A.	1558 Route 23	Carried from September 19, 2024
	Block: 201 Lot: 2.04	

John Kaplan, Esq is representing the objectors, Echelon Car Wash Ventures LLC of Kinnelon. Because of little time remaining at the last meeting, Mr. Kaplan was unable to call his three witnesses.

1. Scott Freund, 260 Hillside Avenue, Chatham is an expert in car washes. He was sworn in and presented his credentials.Motion to accept Mr. Freund as an expert witness: BrownSecond: FinelliAll in favor

He explained the different types of automatic car washes and the anticipated number of vehicles to be serviced by them. The applicant's system can process from 100 up to 120 customers per hour.

He also went into detail the expectations from the use of vacuums for the interior cleaning of the cars.

Open to the public. Seeing no one coming forward a Motion to close the public portion: Brown Second: Finelli All in favor

Lee D Klein of Klein Traffic Consultants, 156 Walker Road, West Orange. He was sworn in and he presented his credentials. Motion to accept Mr. Klein as an expert witness: Brown Second: Finelli All in favor
 Mr. Klein reviewed the traffic patterns within the site and pointed out what he considered to possibly be problematic. He presented a traffic report using the I.T. E Trip Generation Manual 11th Edition as the basis of his report.
 Exhibit - 01 Land Use: 948 Automated Car Wash. This is a chapter within the Trip Generation Manual.

Open to the public. No one coming forward the public portion was closed: Brown Second: Finelli All in favor

3. Donna Holmqvist, Preferred Planning Group, 110 Chestnut Avenue, Montvale was sworn in and, based on previous appearances, she was accepted as an expert planner witness.

She offered three exhibits.

Exhibit - 02 Figure 1 Land Use

Exhibit - 03 Figure 2 Land Use

Exhibit - 04 Adverse Impact

Ms Holmqvist identified all of the d variances and some of the c variance. She detailed the negative impact she believed would occur should this application be approved.

Open to the public. No one coming forward a Motion to close: Brown Second: Finelli All in favor

Recess: 9:00 PM Reconvened: 9:14 PM

Chairman called the meeting back in order

Carl Kemph, Esq., applicant's attorney had retained his right to cross-examine.

He called the applicant's planner John McDonough. He was reminded that he was still under oath.

Mr. McDonough responded to all of the points brought up by the objector's planner. He believed that all of the variances could well be justified.

Open to the public. No one coming forward a motion to close: Brown Second: Finelli All in favor

John Kaplan, Esq, the objector's lawyer, cross examined Mr. McDonough.

Planning Board Planner Tom Behrens gave his analysis of the variances and their impact.

Mr. Kemph was advised that there were only 5 Board members present eligible to vote on the application. Due to the nature of the application, regardless of how many members vote on it, five affirmative votes will be needed. He agreed to carry the vote for preliminary approval to the November 14 meeting. If approved he will then present the site plan for review.

No further notice is required for the QQR application at this time.

**RESOLUTIONS:** 24-004 Krzystof Kaminski, 27 High Street, Block 22 Lot 3. The resolution was prepared by Mr. Brigliadoro and distributed to the Board previous to the meeting. Motion to approve the Resolution: Brown Second: Finelli Ayes: Veneziano, Brown, Finelli, Hough, Reger, Nargiso [Should be published on Sunday, October 27, 2024]

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**October 10, 2024Motion to approve: BrownSecond: VathAyes: Veneziano, Brown, Finelli, Hough, Reger, Nargiso

APPROVAL OF VOUCHER:Voucher 24-10Motion to approve: VenezianoSecond: BrownAyes: Veneziano , Brown, Finelli, Hough, Reger, Nargiso

ADJOURNMENT: 9:53 pm.

Motion: Brown

Second: Finelli

All in favor

Next Regular Meeting November 14, 2024 at 7:30 PM

James Magrad

Chairman